Appendix C: Policy Development Process

Task Force Process

The Task Force launched with a kick-off meeting on April 24, 2020. Over the next week, Co-Chairs and staff met with smaller groups of Task Force members (approximately 10) to hear about the challenges they were seeing on the ground from COVID-19 and what they hoped to achieve from the Task Force process. As a result of these meetings, staff and Co-Chairs scoped a process from May to October 2020, which can be seen in the diagram below.

The May and June meetings of the Task Force focused on facilitating a safe reopening. Work during this phase involved gathering best practices on mitigating the risk of the COVID-19 outbreak to inform development of a Reopening Roadmap and policy ideas to address the challenges of a phased reopening. Over 30 Task Force members gathered information from their networks through interviews or meetings. In addition, the Office of Economic and Workforce Development (OEWD) and the Office of the City Administrator
(Entertainment Commission) hosted industry-specific meetings. Through these engagements, the City heard from over 1,000 people.

Based on the information gathered, the City developed a phased opening approach using the State guidance as a building block, but made more appropriate for San Francisco given it is a dense urban area. In June, the City issued a Reopening Roadmap to allow businesses and residents to plan and to prepare. The roadmap includes an incremental reopening process based on health indicators and each phase is accompanied by additional guidance. More information on the Reopening Roadmap can be found in Appendix A.

The reopening work also involved the development of the Shared Spaces Program. In April and May of 2020, the Task Force heard loud and clear from business owners and merchants’ associations that one of the most urgent needs was access to street and sidewalk space in order to conduct business outside. In response to this, the Task Force convened a group of City staff from relevant departments including OEWD, Public Works, San Francisco Municipal Transit Agency (SFMTA), Planning, Mayor’s Office of Disability, Public Health, Recreation and Parks Department, Port, Digital Services, and Entertainment Commission in order to create a streamlined, expedited, free permit process to allow local businesses to access these public spaces. Through Shared Spaces, hundreds of participating businesses have operated on the streets and sidewalks, contributing to the City’s economic recovery, preserving jobs, serving customers and fostering a vibrant street life. More on this program can be found in Appendix B.

From June to September 2020, the Task Force turned its focus to developing policy recommendations for building resilience into the interim economy and long-term ideas to rebuild a more equitable and resilient San Francisco. During this phase of work, the Task Force formed policy working groups comprised of approximately 20 Task Force members each, focusing on:

1. Jobs and Business
2. Economic Development
3. Vulnerable Populations
4. Arts, Culture, Hospitality, and Entertainment

Each policy group followed the process guide below with some variations. From late June to early August, each policy group met at least four times. During these meetings, the groups worked on developing problem statements and policy ideas. Task Force members brought deep understanding of issues in the San Francisco community and high energy to the process.
The August 6, 2020 meeting of the full Task Force focused on presenting the recommendations from each of the four policy groups. During the month of August, staff and Co-Chairs focused on integrating and refining policy ideas, conducting an equity analysis, and conducting briefings with policy makers. At the September 10, 2020 meeting, the Task Force reviewed the draft report.

### Policy Group Process

The Task Force developed the recommendations by working in four policy groups that were charged with developing recommendations to rebuild a more equitable and resilient San Francisco. Each group was guided by the following framing questions:

1. **Jobs and Business Support**
   - Q: How can we ensure existing small and medium sized businesses across San Francisco survive, adapt, and thrive in a post COVID-19 environment?
   - Q: What do San Franciscans need to (re)enter the workforce?

2. **Economic Development**
   - Q: How can we make it easier to start a new business and rebuild our commercial corridors?
   - Q: How can we promote the growth of our city while protecting existing communities?

3. **Vulnerable Populations**
   - Q: How can we ensure our most vulnerable residents’ needs are met?
   - Q: How do we make it easier for a growing number of people to access and receive the support they need through the recovery?

4. **Arts, Culture, Hospitality, and Entertainment**
   - Q: How do we preserve and strengthen SF’s identity as a hub of world-class and community arts and culture for the long-term?
   - Q: How do we ensure that the artists and cultural diversity embedded in our communities are sustained and uplifted throughout our recovery?
   - Q: How can arts and culture be conveners and leaders in our recovery?

Each group met four to five times between late June and early August 2020 and followed the guide below with some variation. Early meetings focused on developing problem
statements. Subsequent meetings focused on developing policy recommendations to address the identified problems and ways to make the recommendations actionable.

In addition to drawing on the deep experience of Task Force members in the San Francisco community, the policy groups referred to materials from the Task Force’s community engagement and listening efforts, including a general public survey with over 1,000 respondents, a survey of Chinatown businesses and residents, an Arts, Culture, Hospitality, and Entertainment (ACHE) survey, and engagement with stakeholder groups including the Commission on the Status of Women, the Immigrant Rights Commission, and the Mayor’s Office of Disability. More information on the community engagement and listening efforts for the Task Force can be found in Appendix D.

Based on this information, the policy groups developed problem statements and themes to ensure the recommendations respond to the conditions that San Franciscans are facing:

**Jobs and Business**
- Revenues have declined without a commensurate decrease in expenses, creating much fiscal instability for businesses
- Workers laid off from the hospitality, entertainment, and other industries need to rapidly find other work/income while these industries are recovering
- Workers that were economically and/or physically vulnerable before are even more vulnerable now
- The City makes it too difficult and expensive to operate a small business
- Zoning and building code rules are barriers to starting, growing, or changing a business

**Basic Needs**
- There are barriers to testing, PPE, and care for vulnerable workers
- Unhoused people are uniquely vulnerable to COVID-19
- Shelter-in-place and lack of in-person services is straining mental health
- Workers cannot realistically reenter the workforce without adequate affordable and safe child care
- Individuals and families are increasingly experiencing hunger and difficulty accessing basic needs

**Wealth Building and Access to Opportunity**
- Lack of investment, limited access to banking, financial predation, and criminalization of poverty and immigration drive a huge wealth gap in communities of color
• Undocumented immigrants do not have access to the same spectrum of supports
• Upward economic mobility is made more difficult by decentralized information, lack of training, unfamiliarity with digital resources, and hard-to-find opportunities, resources, and programs, especially for young adults and other new job-seekers

Housing
• Many are on the verge of homelessness or displacement
• It takes too long and is too expensive to build housing
• We are not producing enough permanently affordable housing to meet our City’s need
• We need to ensure stability of rental housing and tenants

ACHE
• ACHE sectors are hurting. They have been disproportionately impacted during COVID-19. They are the backbone of our economy and jobs, community cohesion, and spirit
• ACHE sectors include for-profit businesses, non-profits, individual artists, and contract workers. We need them all and need to support them all
• We need to improve our outdoor and indoor “game”: ACHE sectors can support these public and private spaces to be more vibrant and active
• Neighborhood-based solutions are key
• ACHE workers have been disproportionately impacted by COVID-19; we need to create and retain jobs in these sectors
• ACHE work is often hybrid and doesn’t fit easily into reopening phases
• Recovery plans need to prioritize equity and support small and BIPOC-serving ACHE business and organizations

The policy groups then developed recommendations to address these problems and consider how to achieve an equitable and resilient San Francisco. For example, the vulnerable populations group framed their work in terms of economic justice:

For San Francisco to recover, its government and institutions need to ensure that all people, especially communities of color that have faced generations of structural racism, have equitable access to wealth building and financial protections; equitable access to opportunity and information; and the means to contribute to the economy and have their basic needs met.
Throughout, the Task Force focused on those communities most impacted by the COVID-19 pandemic and the resulting economic consequences. Groups identified as especially vulnerable in this time include:

- **Populations:** Disability community, food insecure, health vulnerable, LGBTQI community, limited-English proficient, immigrants, low-income, re-entry population, seniors, transitional-age youth, undocumented workers, unhoused neighbors
- **Communities of Color:** Black, Native American/Indigenous, Latinx, Asian/Pacific Islander
- **Place-based Communities:** Residents of the Bayview, Chinatown, Excelsior, Mission, OMI, Richmond, SOMA, Sunset, Tenderloin, Visitacion Valley, and Western Addition neighborhoods

In order to ensure equity as a core goal of the Task Force, every recommendation achieves at least one of the following:

- Explicitly addresses racial disparities, and its implementation should result in the reduction or elimination of racial inequities
- Protects against racial violence, racial profiling, implicit/explicit bias, and discrimination
- Helps eliminate barriers to access resources, social services, public benefits, and institutions
- Advances full inclusion, belonging, and civic engagement for San Franciscans
- Meaningfully improves the conditions of communities of color and/or preserves or strengthens the ability of San Franciscans to achieve their full potential

**Developing Policy Recommendations**

Each policy group went through a process to brainstorm policy recommendations to address the problem statements described above. Each group took unique approaches in deciding which recommendations to include in the report, based on urgency of need, consensus, feasibility and other factors. For more information on the policy recommendations, please see detailed policy memos in Appendix E.